

**From:** [Rosa Celorio](#)  
**To:** [Magerkurth, Christina](#)  
**Cc:** [Grady, Mary](#)  
**Subject:** Re: FW: ART Appeals Committee  
**Date:** Friday, October 6, 2023 1:08:36 PM

---

**CAUTION:** This email originated outside Winrock. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Christy:

Thank you for your message and clarifying all of this. I reviewed the TORs and do have a few questions/reactions on the process for this appeal, from the viewpoint of indigenous peoples' rights. I also understand that this is the first time that you are implementing this Appeal process, so these are factors which may affect its legitimacy and effectiveness.

#### Content/Process Considerations

-Have you considered providing for non-voting subject matter experts?

-Do all Committee members have experience on indigenous peoples' rights? What was the criteria for selecting them?

-In Section IV, paragraph 15, the TORs refer to "Article 3.1 of the Guidance"? The Guidance is also mentioned in several sections of the TOR's. Has this Guidance been seen by the Amerindian People Association (APA)? It is important that this process fully meets FPIC requirements. This means that all parties involved are aware in advance of any guidance that may be applicable to the process.

-Has the APA been informed previously of all the conditions laid out in section VII? Have they been offered the opportunity to submit comments on these TORs in general?

-In terms of the written record that the Committee will be considering, is there a possibility to consider external documents?

-Can the appeal consider substantive issues raised in the complaint?

-Will the Committee have the authority to issue recommendations for the ART Secretariat to implement?

#### Format

-Please note that my correct name is "Rosa Celorio" and please amend that in the TOR's.

I will greatly appreciate in advance your response to these questions.

All the best and thanks,

Rosa Celorio

On Thu, Oct 5, 2023 at 4:14 PM Magerkurth, Christina <[Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org](mailto:Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org)> wrote:

Dear Rosa,

Thank you for the email. The Terms of Reference were not intended to be negotiated as they simply reflect the scope of work and confidentiality for the process. If you have questions, we would be happy to answer them though, so please let me know.

Sincerely,

Christy

---

**From:** Rosa Celorio <[rcelorio@law.gwu.edu](mailto:rcelorio@law.gwu.edu)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 5, 2023 7:06 AM  
**To:** Magerkurth, Christina <[Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org](mailto:Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org)>  
**Cc:** Grady, Mary <[MGrady@WINROCK.ORG](mailto:MGrady@WINROCK.ORG)>  
**Subject:** Re: FW: ART Appeals Committee

**CAUTION:** This email originated outside Winrock. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Christy - Thank you very much for your follow-up. I will review the Terms of Reference and get back to you with any questions or comments I may have. Are you open to incorporating comments before I sign the TOR's?

All the best and many thanks,

Rosa

On Tue, Oct 3, 2023 at 9:02 AM Magerkurth, Christina <[Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org](mailto:Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org)> wrote:

Dear Dr. Celorio,

I hope you are well. I wanted to follow-up on my earlier correspondence. It is important that we have the appeals process move forward to ensure the appellant receives a response in a timely manner. Could you please sign the Terms of Reference no later than Friday,

October 6<sup>th</sup> so that we may schedule the initial meeting? I just resent the DocuSign link. Please let me know if you did not receive it.

If you have any questions, please let me know. Thank you again for your willingness to participate in this process.

Sincerely,

Christy

---

**From:** Magerkurth, Christina  
**Sent:** Monday, September 18, 2023 1:36 PM  
**To:** Roselyn Fosuah Adjei <[yafossy@yahoo.com](mailto:yafossy@yahoo.com)>; [rcelerio@law.gwu.edu](mailto:rcelerio@law.gwu.edu);  
[tcgreen100@gmail.com](mailto:tcgreen100@gmail.com)  
**Cc:** Grady, Mary <[MGrady@WINROCK.ORG](mailto:MGrady@WINROCK.ORG)>  
**Subject:** ART Appeals Committee

Dear Dr. Celerio, Mr. Green, and Ms. Fosuah Adjei,

Thank you for agreeing to be on the ART Appeals Committee. We appreciate your participating in this important process. Attached please find the Terms of Reference for the process that explain the steps more fully. I will be sending a version of the document for you to sign via DocuSign. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to reach out. As soon as we have received all signatures, we will provide the initial documents and schedule our first meeting.

Sincerely,

Christy

**Christina Magerkurth** Managing Director

Architecture for REDD+ Transactions, Secretariat at Winrock International

office 571.402.4821 | e-mail [Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org](mailto:Christina.Magerkurth@winrock.org)

---

The information in this message, including any attachments, is the property of Winrock International (discloser), is intended solely for the use of the individual(s) or entity to which this message is addressed, and may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, or the person responsible for delivering this message to the intended recipient, please notify the sender and immediately delete this message.

--

Rosa Celorio

Associate Dean for International and Comparative Legal Studies and Burnett Family Distinguished Professorial Lecturer in International and Comparative Law and Policy  
The George Washington University Law School  
2000 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20052  
Phone: (202) 994-1210  
Email: [Rcelorio@law.gwu.edu](mailto:Rcelorio@law.gwu.edu) | Twitter: [@celorio\\_rosa](https://twitter.com/celorio_rosa)

For more information and publications: <https://www.law.gwu.edu/rosa-celorio>

For International and Comparative Law Program  
news: [Webpage](#) | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Newsletter](#) | [YouTube](#)

New Publications:

[\*The Kaleidoscope of Climate Change and Human Rights: The Promise of International Litigation for Women, Indigenous Peoples, and Children\*](#), 13 Ariz. J. Env't. L. & POL'Y 155 (Spring 2023).

[\*International Human Rights: Problems of Law, Policy, and Practice, Seventh Edition\*](#), Aspen Publishing, with Hurst Hannum, S. James Anaya, Dinah L. Shelton & Rosa Celorio (2023)

--

Rosa Celorio

Associate Dean for International and Comparative Legal Studies and Burnett Family  
Distinguished Professorial Lecturer in International and Comparative Law and Policy  
The George Washington University Law School  
2000 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20052  
Phone: (202) 994-1210  
Email: [Rcelorio@law.gwu.edu](mailto:Rcelorio@law.gwu.edu) | Twitter: [@celorio\\_rosa](https://twitter.com/celorio_rosa)

For more information and publications: <https://www.law.gwu.edu/rosa-celorio>

For International and Comparative Law Program  
news: [Webpage](#) | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Newsletter](#) | [YouTube](#)

New Publications:

*[The Kaleidoscope of Climate Change and Human Rights: The Promise of International Litigation for Women, Indigenous Peoples, and Children](#)*, 13 Ariz. J. Env't. L. & POL'Y 155 (Spring 2023).

*[International Human Rights: Problems of Law, Policy, and Practice, Seventh Edition](#)*, Aspen Publishing, with Hurst Hannum, S. James Anaya, Dinah L. Shelton & Rosa Celorio (2023)